



Appendix H
MCA Table
Section 3.2C2

Cycling Stonebridge
Road to Crinken Lane
Options

MCA Section 3.2C2 - Cycling Stonebridge Road to Crinken Lane								
Assessment Criteria	Assessment Sub-Criteria	Previous MCA	New Option	New Option	New Option	New Option	New Option	
		EPR Option (Dublin Rd as far as St Anne's, diversion to Lower Rd-Stonebridge Close-Mountainview)	Scheme Option 3.2C3 (M11 Cycle Track, Mountainview)	Scheme Option 3.2C4 (Library Road / Stonebridge Close)	Scheme Option 3.2C5 (Library Road / Assumpta Park)	Scheme Option 3.2C6 (Dublin Rd Cycle Route)	Scheme Option 3.2C7 (Corbawn Lane to Stonebridge Rd only)	
Economy	1.a. Capital Cost		1.4km	1.4km	1.3km	0km	0.6km	
	Rank							
	1.b. Transport Reliability and Quality	Segregated cycle track provided on Dublin Rd beside CBC which would not affect bus reliability, cycle diversion then onto adjacent local roads. Cycle crossing of mainline to get to Lower Rd would require signals which may affect journey time reliability	Dedicated adjacent cycle track provided, no impact on bus reliability	Northbound cyclists would share bus lane from Crinken Lane to Quinn's Rd, and southbound cyclists would share general traffic lane operating under signal controlled priority, potentially affecting bus time reliability	Dedicated adjacent cycle track provided, no impact on bus reliability	No segregated cycle provision, cyclists will share either general traffic or bus lanes with vehicles, potentially causing delays to other vehicles	Two-way cycle track along Dublin Rd from Corbawn Lane to Stonebridge Rd on the southbound footpath, crossing to Stonebridge Rd and running as far as Stonebridge Lane on the northern side of the road. Cyclists would share road with traffic/buses along remainder of the section length	
Integration	2.a. Land Use Integration	Links adjacent residential areas to schools on Stonebridge Rd, medical facilities and library, and onwards onto main village street	Does not link to any specific community services or residential areas within Shankill	Links adjacent residential areas to schools on Stonebridge Rd, medical facilities and library, and onwards onto main village street	Links adjacent residential areas to schools on Stonebridge Rd, library, and onwards to Crinken Lane where it joins main route	Cyclists using main road which would link planned or current residential and educational attractors along the route	Links adjacent residential areas to church and schools along Stonebridge Rd	
	Rank							
	2.b. Residential Population and Employment Catchments	This option directly serves housing along the western side of Shankill, but is not a direct route	This option would not be directly accessible to people along most of this section of the route and would require travel along a road without direct cycle provision to get to the new cycle route	This option directly serves housing along the western side of Shankill, but is not a direct route	This option directly serves housing along the western side of Shankill, but is not a direct route	This option directly serves housing along the western side of Shankill, but is not a direct route	This options serves Shankill Village and connects all population areas along the Dublin Rd	This option provides a cycle link from the main housing concentration to the east of Shankill, to safely link to the two main schools in the area
	Rank							
	2.c. Transport Network Integration	Options are equal for this criteria	Options are equal for this criteria	Options are equal for this criteria	Options are equal for this criteria	Options are equal for this criteria	Options are equal for this criteria	Options are equal for this criteria
	Rank							
2.d. Cycle Network Integration	This option is considered less preferable due to previous consultation feedback and narrowness of Lower Rd	This option provides the best direct straight route for a dedicated segregated cycle track adjacent to the M11, in accordance with the GDA CNP. However, it is only accessible to Shankill residents at two points, as noted in 2b above.	This option is less preferable due to tight laneway from Hilltop Lawn to Stonebridge Close, past the HSE building	This option is considered less preferable due to narrow lane from Hilltop Lawn	Route would align with the GDA CNP Primary Route. However no specific cycle segregation provided.	This option would not provide a continuous segregated cycle network from Bray to Loughlinstown but it does provide a segregated cycle option to two schools from the main population centre in the area. GDA CNP still accessible along Dublin Rd.		
Accessibility & Social Inclusion	2.e. Traffic Network Integration	Options are equal for this criteria	Options are equal for this criteria	Options are equal for this criteria	Options are equal for this criteria	Options are equal for this criteria	Options are equal for this criteria	
	Rank							
	3.a. Key Trip Attractors (Education/Health/Commercial/Employment)	Links adjacent residential areas to schools on Stonebridge Rd, medical facilities and library, and onwards onto main village street	Does not link to any specific community services or residential areas within Shankill, but provides commuter linkage onwards to employment areas	Links adjacent residential areas to schools on Stonebridge Rd, medical facilities and library, and onwards onto main village street	Links adjacent residential areas to schools on Stonebridge Rd, library, and onwards to Crinken Lane where it joins main route	Despite lack of segregated cycle facilities this option directly links the adjacent housing along Dublin Rd and the two schools along the route	This option directly links the main housing centre to the east to two large schools in the area	
Safety	Rank							
	3.b. Deprived Geographic Areas	Options are equal for this criteria	Options are equal for this criteria	Options are equal for this criteria	Options are equal for this criteria	Options are equal for this criteria	Options are equal for this criteria	
	Rank							
4.a. Road Safety	This option is considered less appropriate due to the narrowness of side roads and the number of junctions it passes through	This option is considered good under this criteria as it is entirely segregated and does not pass through any major junctions	This option receives a lower ranking due to the section that passes along the main Dublin Rd and through the associated junctions, and runs with the main traffic flows for sections along Dublin Rd	This option is considered good in that it has minor road junctions it passes through, but does not run along the main Dublin Rd with other traffic or through major junctions	This option receives a lower ranking due to it using the main Dublin Rd and passing through the associated junctions. A 30kph section from Stonebridge Rd, through the village, and towards the new junction at Olcovar would be incorporated as part of this option.	This option would provide a segregated cycle track for school children from the main housing centre in the east to two schools, with toucan crossings at required locations. On the remainder of the route cyclists would share the general carriageway with general traffic or buses. A 30kph section from Stonebridge Rd, through the village, and towards the new junction at Olcovar would be incorporated as part of this option.		
6.a. Archaeology and Cultural Heritage	Rank							
	Options are equal for this criteria	Options are equal for this criteria	Options are equal for this criteria	Options are equal for this criteria	Options are equal for this criteria	Options are equal for this criteria	Options are equal for this criteria	
Rank								

	6.b. Architectural Heritage	This option has potential to have some impact on adjacent architectural stock or properties	This option will have least if any impact on adjacent architectural stock	This option has the potential to have more of an impact on adjacent architectural stock or properties than other options south of Quinn's Rd	This option has potential to have some impact on adjacent architectural stock or properties	This option will have no impact on any adjacent architectural heritage as no additional land required for cycle tracks	This option will have an impact on a section of St Anne's church boundary wall, which will need to be relocated, along with the statue at the entrance
	Rank						
	6.c. Flora & Fauna	Less dense tree clearance of approx. 400m ² (100m x 4m wide) required to bring track from Dublin Rd to Lower Rd	Tree line of approx. 500m ² (100m x 5m width) to be affected to enable cycle track to cross M11 tree line	Less tree clearance required but some anticipated due to need to widen Dublin Rd south of Quinn's Rd	Considered likely to have little flora and fauna impact	This option will have no impact on any adjacent flora or fauna as no additional land required for cycle tracks	This option will impact on the portion of St Anne's church boundary that is hedgerows, and trees behind boundary walls at four adjacent Dublin Road properties, but these would be impacted in any case by the required road widening.
	Rank						
Environment	6.d. Soils and Geology	Option considered to have some but not most soils and geology impact	Option considered to have most soil impact due to route along M11 verge and tree line	Option considered to have some but not most soils and geology impact	Option considered to have some but not most soils and geology impact	No additional impact as a result of cycle tracks	Option considered to have some but not most soils and geology impact
	Rank						
	6.e. Hydrology	Options are equal for this criteria	Options are equal for this criteria	Options are equal for this criteria	Options are equal for this criteria	Options are equal for this criteria	Options are equal for this criteria
	Rank						
	6.f. Landscape and Visual	Considered less favourable due to impact on currently quiet residential streets (Lower Rd, Mountainview)	Considered better performing due to reduced visual and community impact as minimising the passing of route through residential areas, and utilises current unused lands.	Considered less favourable due to impact on currently quiet residential streets	Considered less favourable due to impact on currently quiet residential streets (Library Rd, New Vale, Mountainview), and impact on small gardens at end of Assumpta Park.	No additional impact as a result of cycle tracks	Considered acceptable due to reduced impact along provided cycle track, including a section which will be set back through existing trees along Stonebridge Road.
	Rank						
	6.g. Air Quality	Options are equal for this criteria	Options are equal for this criteria	Options are equal for this criteria	Options are equal for this criteria	Options are equal for this criteria	Options are equal for this criteria
	Rank						
	6.h. Noise and Vibration	Options are equal for this criteria	Options are equal for this criteria	Options are equal for this criteria	Options are equal for this criteria	Options are equal for this criteria	Options are equal for this criteria
	Rank						
6.i. Land Use Character	Options are equal for this criteria	Options are equal for this criteria	Options are equal for this criteria	Options are equal for this criteria	Options are equal for this criteria	Options are equal for this criteria	
Rank							